



KUTAFIN UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

Volume 1

December 2014

Issue 2

INTERPRETIVE APPROACH IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

**PUBLIC SERVANTS BEHAVIOURS IN SUPPORT
OF THE RULE OF LAW**

GAME OF THRONES: RELIGION AND STATE IN ISRAEL

**CONFIDENTIALITY IN INTERNATIONAL
COMMERCIAL ARBITRATION**

DIFFERENT POINTS OF VIEW ON FREEDOM OF SPEECH

**Next
issue**

**SOCIALIST PRIVATE LAW:
OXYMORON OR SPECIAL
MODEL?**

www.kulawr.ru



www.kulawr.ru

info.kulawr@gmail.com

*THE BEST IDEAS
ARE
ALWAYS WELCOMED!*



KUTAFIN UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

Volume 1

December 2014

Issue 2

Senior Editorial Council

Andrea Bonomi
(University of Lausanne)

Bill Bowring
(University of Essex)

William Butler
(Pennsylvania State University)

Peter Van Elsuwege
(University of Ghent)

Christophe Hillion
(University of Leiden)

Dimitry Kochenov
(University of Groningen)

Sergey Pashin
(Higher School of Economics, Moscow)

Roman Petrov
(Kyiv-Mohyla Academy)

Csaba Varga
(Catholic University, Budapest)

Junjie Zhang
(Minzu University of China)

Editorial Board Team

Editors-in-Chief

Irina Alebastrova
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Paul Kalinichenko
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Executive Editor

Olga Shevchenko
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

International Editors

Natalia Sokolova
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Maria Zakharova
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Online Editor

Sergey Zaikin
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Promotion Editors

Maria Antokolskaja
(VU University Amsterdam)

Yulia Kalinina
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Bartosz Mendyk
(Jan Kochanowski University, Kielce)

Vladimir Zhbakov
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Projects Editor

Nikita Lyutov
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Submissions Editors

Marina Lazareva
(Kutafin University, Vologda)

Public Relations Editors

Alexander Ermolenko
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Olga Gourjian
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Diversity and Development Editors

Alexey Salomatin
(University of Penza)

Oleksiy Kresin
(Volodymyr Koretskyi Institute
of State and Law, Kyiv)

Boris Strashun
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Editors

Jensen Bigelow
(Davidson College, North Carolina)

Arsen Gourjian
(Worcester Polytechnic Institute,
Massachusetts)

Junior (Student) Editors

Anna Brodskaya
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Olga Gavrilova
(Kutafin University, Moscow)

Frequency

two issues per year

Contacts

www.kulawr.ru
info.kulawr@gmail.com
+7 (499) 244-86-85

KULawR always welcomes new
authors and sponsors

Publisher

Kutafin Moscow
State Law University (MSAL)
9 Sadovaya-Kudrinskaya str.,
Moscow, Russia, 123995
<http://msal.ru/en/>
msal@msal.ru

+7 (499) 244-86-35

The opinions expressed in
submissions do not necessarily
reflect the position of the
Editorial Body and Council.

All rights reserved. Any
part of this journal may not be
published elsewhere without the
written consent of the publisher

II BRIEF TABLE OF CONTENTS

Welcome Note	152
--------------------	-----

LEGAL TRANSFORMATIONS AND THEORETICAL INSIGHTS

International Law Raison d'être

and the Grounds for the Interpretive Approach

Article by Gianluigi Palombella	153
---------------------------------------	-----

LEGAL PRACTICE

Behaviours in Support of the Rule of Law

Essay by Anthony Inglese	180
--------------------------------	-----

SPORTS LAW

Contracts for Sports Services

Article by Dimitrios P. Panagiotopoulos	191
---	-----

PUBLICITY AND CONFIDENTIALITY IN LAW

Sources of Confidentiality Obligations

in International Commercial Arbitration

Article by Elza Reymond-Eniaeva.....	208
--------------------------------------	-----

STATE AND RELIGION

Game of Thrones: The Ongoing Discourse

on Religion and State in Israel

Essay by Liana Voloch	235
-----------------------------	-----

CONFERENCE PAPER

Legal Regulation of Advocates Ethics

in the Russian Federation

Paper by Nikolay Kipnis.....	247
------------------------------	-----

CASE REVIEW

Freedom of Speech as it is:

Talking about a French Comedian,

US Official and the Russian Truth

Review by Maria Zakharova.....	258
--------------------------------	-----

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

III

Welcome Note	152
--------------------	-----

LEGAL TRANSFORMATIONS AND THEORETICAL INSIGHTS

International Law Raison d'être

and the Grounds for the Interpretive Approach

Article by Gianluigi Palombella	153
---------------------------------------	-----

1. Re-setting the Scene in the Supranational Domain.....	154
2. About Types and Function of Principles in IL	157
3. Dworkin's Posthumous Work on a Theory of International Law	164
4. An Interpretive (Adjudicative) Theory of law.....	167
5. An Interpretive Lens on Exemplary Case Law.....	170
6. Concluding Remarks.....	176

LEGAL PRACTICE

Behaviours in Support of the Rule of Law

Essay by Anthony Inglese	180
--------------------------------	-----

I. Introduction.....	181
II. The Structure of Legal Advisory Services within the UK Government	181
III. The Commitment to the Rule of Law as a Practice	182
IV. Conclusion	189
Bibliography	190

SPORTS LAW

Contracts for Sports Services

Essay by Dimitrios P. Panagiotopoulos.....	191
--	-----

I. Introduction.....	192
II. Sports Categories	193
III. Sports Capacity	194
A. Introduction	194
B. Sports Capacity as a Legal Fiction.....	196
C. Sports Capacity Attributed by Right	197

IV DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

IV. The Provision of Sports Services	199
A. Introduction	199
B. Latent Agreement for Amateur Athlete Remuneration	200
C. Amateur Athletes' Rights	202
V. Athletes' Agreements/Contracts	203
A. Nature of the Agreement.....	203
B. Professional Athletes	203
C. Provision of Sports Services.....	205
VI. Conclusion	205
Bibliography	206

PUBLICITY AND CONFIDENTIALITY IN LAW

Sources of Confidentiality Obligations

in International Commercial Arbitration

Article by Elza Reymond-Eniaeva	208
---------------------------------------	-----

I. INTRODUCTION	209
II. EXPRESS AGREEMENT.....	212
III. INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION RULES	215
A. Introduction	215
B. UNCITRAL Rules.....	216
C. LCIA Rules.....	216
D. Swiss Rules	218
E. ICC Rules	219
F. WIPO Rules	220
G. Conclusion.....	222
IV. GENERALLY ACCEPTED ARBITRAL PRACTICE	223
V. NATIONAL LEGISLATION AND CASE LAW	226
A. Introduction	226
i. Applicable Law.....	226
B. National Arbitration Laws	227
C. Case Law of National Courts	230
D. National Rules	231
VI. CONCLUSION	231
Bibliography	233

STATE AND RELIGION

***Game of Thrones: The Ongoing Discourse
on Religion and State in Israel (part 1)***

Essay by Liana Voloch 235

I. Introduction..... 236

II. Sources of Law in Israel 238

A. The Constitutional Revolution

and its Influence in Terms of Religion 240

B. “Jewish and Democratic State” 242

CONFERENCE PAPER

***Legal Regulation of Advocates Ethics
in the Russian Federation***

Paper by Nikolay Kipnis..... 247

CASE REVIEW

***Freedom of Speech as it is: Talking about a French Comedian,
US Official and the Russian Truth***

Review by Maria Zakharova258

Dear readers,

Let us present the second volume of the Kutafin University Law Review (KULawR) to you. You are holding in your hands an innovative product created behind the walls of the Kutafin Moscow State Law University for both Russian and foreign legal community. Previously, apart from some exceptions, Russian legal knowledge was not accessible for English-speaking auditoria.

The first volume of the KULawR was published in September 2014. We tried to present and spread it among wide range of lawyers over the World. We would like to assure you that we are doing our best in order to create a new international fora for international legal collaboration and exchanging experiences and opinions in the framework of our journal.

The current volume covers different topics in the fields of constitutional, international, contractual, international private branches of law as well as a theory and history of law. It united authors from all over the world representing different legal cultures with their unique understanding of law. It looks like a real international consortium of legal mindset, estimations, opinions and knowledge.

We would really like to welcome you to pages of the Kutafin University Law Review. You can also become a part of our Journal team. The KULawR equally accepts submissions from both well-known scholars and talented newcomers. It's a great opportunity to make a step together in order to share our common ideas and contribute to a legal scholarship.

The best ideas are always welcomed!

All additional information you can find on the web page of the journal at www.kulawr.ru.

Kindest regards,

Editors-in-Chief

Irina Alebastrova, PhD, Associate Professor

Paul Kalinichenko, Doctor of science (Law), Professor

ARTICLE

INTERNATIONAL LAW RAISON D'ETRE AND THE GROUNDS FOR THE INTERPRETIVE APPROACH

By Gianluigi Palombella

Author

*PHD (Law), cum laude, Scuola Superiore di Pisa, 1980
Full Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Parma and
Scuola Superiore di Studi Universitari 'Sant'Anna' di Pisa
E-mail: g.palombella@sssup.it*

Abstract

*In constitutional States, principles are of different kinds. Some are of procedural nature or point to the functioning of law ('how'), some others encapsulate the *raison d'être*, purpose and value ('what' and 'why') of the legal order, as a whole. With regard to the International legal system the second kind of principles remains much disputed upon, although a clarification of such an issue would be of relevance in the development of IL, especially in the adjudicative sphere. One of the obstacles to overcome is certainly the account and narrative that legal positivism has offered of IL. This article shall explain, on the one hand, some weaknesses of traditional positivism, with particular concern for the transformation and interweaving of legalities in the supranational sphere. On the other hand, it shall appraise especially the contribution by the late Ronald Dworkin to IL, and how his interpretive theory of law can be projected onto the international environment. Eventually, recent cases before international Courts shall be considered, that expose the way judicial reasoning actually profits from asking questions of principles.*

Keywords

International law, principles, legal regimes, legal adjudication, interpretivism, justice.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Re-setting the Scene in the Supranational Domain	154
2. About Types and Function of Principles in IL.....	157
3. Dworkin's Posthumous Work on a Theory of International Law.....	164
4. An Interpretive (Adjudicative) Theory of law	167
5. An Interpretive Lens on Exemplary Case Law	170
6. Concluding Remarks	176

1. Re-setting the Scene in the Supranational Domain

1.1. In the last decade the approach to law has been deeply affected by the constitutional way of thinking. It influences both the interpretive endeavours of courts and legal theory advancements. The appearance of the European constitutions, after World War II, shifted the legal universe from the *Rechtsstaat*, *Stato di diritto*,¹ to the 'constitutional' legal State. This change channeled the posited law through substantive and procedural principles that have become the criteria of recognition, validity and constitutional legitimacy of ordinary legislation. *Mutatis mutandis* - new frames have been provided for the International Law (IL) under the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the *United Nations Charter* and the European Convention of Human Rights. A large number of regional and quasi-universal agreements, conventions and treaties reoriented legal intercourses, duties and guarantees on the basis of a newly forged substantive programme of principles. And as a matter of fact, despite their disputed nature, principles play a crucial role in the International Law and the Administration of Justice. Principles do not only fill the legal gaps, but also serve as fundamental means for the interpretation of rules and the enhancement of legal reasoning.²

¹ JR Silkenat, JE Hickey, PD Barenboim, *The Legal Doctrines of the Rule of Law and the Legal State (Rechtsstaat)*, Springer, Dordrecht 2014.

² F Raimondo, *General Principles of Law in the Decisions of International Criminal Courts and Tribunals* (Brill, Leiden 2008).

However, while a role of principles in States' ambit increases, International Law seems to overlook that special kind of principles which characterizes the identity and builds up the foundation of a legal order. This is due both to the dominant authority of legal positivism in western legal theory, and to the poor elaboration that the latter has made of the international legal order specifically.

1.2. Legal philosophers of the last century, apart from Hans Kelsen, have barely deepened their understanding of International Law for both cultural and analytical reasons. Herbert Hart understated the legality of IL, as minor and incomplete, *vis à vis* the State, the perfect, central case, for the concept of law.³ Such thesis can only in part be explained by the features and the structure of the International Law of late 50s.

Last decade registers two different reactions in legal theory scholarship. The first one concentrates on Hartian theory of law, and tries to amend it from the inside. It acknowledges that chapter X of the Concept of Law⁴ (Hart) is 'embarrassing',⁵ and that the thesis assuming the absence of secondary rules in IL is erroneous.

This means that Hartian theory can and should be applied in the international order, either for IL advancement in the subsequent years or because of the characteristics that were overlooked by Hart.⁶ This holds true as well for the Hartian 'fundamental norm', *id est* the rule of recognition, that is now found inside the IL system, through criteria set by Art. 38 of the Statute of the ICJ⁷ as well as those enshrined in the Vienna Convention for the Law of Treaties.⁸ Hartian theory is also adopted in order to describe the newly transformed scenarios where global legal authorities and extra-

³ HLA Hart, *The Concept of Law* (with a Postscript edited by PA Bulloch and J Raz) (2nd ed, OUP 1997).

⁴ *ibid.*

⁵ J Waldron, 'International Law: 'A Relatively Small and Unimportant' Part of Jurisprudence?' (2013) NYU Law, Public law and Legal Theory WP 209.

⁶ S Besson, 'Theorizing the Sources of International Law' (2010) *The Philosophy of International Law* 163.

⁷ Waldron (n 1) 219.

⁸ Waldron (n 1) 219.